

The Law of Occupation

Continuity and Change of International
Humanitarian Law, and its Interaction with
International Human Rights Law

By

Yutaka Arai-Takahashi



Arts & Humanities
Research Council

MARTINUS

NIJHOFF

PUBLISHERS

LEIDEN • BOSTON
2009

Contents

Preface	xxvii
The List of Abbreviations	xxxix
Prolegomenon	xxxix

PART I

THE GENERAL PRINCIPLES OF THE LAW OF OCCUPATION

Chapter 1: The Scope of Application of the Law of Occupation	3
1. Introduction	3
2. The Meaning of Occupation and the Scope of Application	
<i>Ratione Materiae</i> of the Law of Occupation	5
2.1. Overview	5
2.2. Effective Control	6
2.3. Control of a Territory Beyond the Territorial Boundaries of	
the Occupying Power	8
2.4. Irrelevance of “Official” Proclamation by <i>de facto</i> Occupying	
Powers	10
3. The Scope of Application <i>Ratione Personae</i> of the Law of	
Occupation	12
4. The Scope of Application <i>Ratione Temporis</i> of the Law of	
Occupation	16
4.1. The Commencement of Occupation	16
4.2. The Termination of Occupation	16
4.3. Criteria for Assessing the End of Occupation: Effective	
Handover and Elections	19
5. The Rules Concerning <i>Postliminium</i>	24
6. Different Categories of Occupation	26
6.1. Overview	26
6.2. Post-Armistice Occupation	27
6.3. The “Mixed Occupation” (<i>Mischbesetzung</i>)	28
6.4. Post-Surrender Occupation	30

6.5. Post- <i>Debellatio</i> Occupation (Occupation based on <i>Debellatio</i>)	37
6.6. Pacific Occupation (<i>Occupatio Pacifica</i>)	40
7. Basic Rules on the Law of Belligerent Occupation	42
7.1. The Transitional Nature of Occupation	42
7.2. Oath of Obedience, and not Oath of Allegiance	43
7.3. The Interdiction of Annexation	44
8. The Exclusion of Applicability of the Law of Occupation?	46
8.1. Overview	46
8.2. The Relationship between the Legality in <i>Jus ad Bellum</i> and the Applicability of the Law of Occupation	46
8.3. A Brief Examination of the “Missing Reversioner” Theory ...	47
9. Conclusion	52
 Chapter 2: Sources of the Law of Occupation	 55
1. Introduction	55
2. Treaty Law	55
3. Customary International Humanitarian Law	57
4. The Fourth Geneva Convention as Customary International Law	59
5. General Principles of International Law	65
5.1. Overview	65
5.2. The Principle of Self-Determination	65
5.3. General Principles of International Humanitarian Law and the Martens Clause	68
6. Security Council Resolutions Adopted under Chapter VII of the UN Charter	72
6.1. Overview	72
6.2. Derogability of Security Council Resolutions from the Law of Occupation	72
6.3. Can the Security Council Acting under Chapter VII of the UN Charter Override Obligations under IHL and International Human Rights Law?	79
6.4. Security Council Resolutions Must Abide by <i>Jus Cogens</i>	82
6.5. The Relationship between Security Council Resolution 1483 and the Law of Occupation	85
7. Conclusion	89
 Chapter 3: The Legislative Competence of the Occupying Power under Article 43 of the 1907 Hague Regulations	 91
1. The Scope of Legislative Power under Article 43 of the 1907 Hague Regulations	91

2. The Origin of Article 43 of the 1907 Hague Regulations – Articles 2 and 3 of the Brussels Declaration of 1874	93
3. The Meaning of the Expression “vie publique”	96
4. The Meaning of the Words “les lois en vigueur”	97
5. The Obligation to Restore and Ensure Public Order and Civil Life	98
5.1. The Nature of Obligations	98
5.2. The Obligations Relating to <i>Public Order</i>	98
5.3. The Obligation to <i>Ensure</i> Public Order and Civil Life	99
6. Laws Enacted by “Absent” Sovereign	101
7. Exceptions to Article 43 of the 1907 Hague Regulations	102
7.1. “ <i>Empêchement absolu</i> ”	102
7.2. Welfare of the Population	106
8. State Practice in Relation to Article 43 of the 1907 Hague Regulations during the Two World Wars	107
9. Abrogation of Fascist Laws under the Necessity Test	109
10. Waiver of Article 43 of the 1907 Hague Regulations by a Subsequent Agreement?	111
11. Conclusion	113

Chapter 4: The Legislative Competence of the Occupying Power under the Fourth Geneva Convention	115
1. Introduction	115
2. Article 64 of GCIV and the Necessity Exceptions	116
2.1. Article 64 of GCIV	116
2.2. Drafting Records of Article 64 of GCIV	117
3. The Scope of Legislative Power of the Occupant under Article 64 of GCIV	120
3.1. Three Elements of Incoherence	120
3.2. The Relationship between Article 43 of the 1907 Hague Regulations and Article 64 of GCIV	120
4. Three Elements of Necessity under Article 64 of GCIV	123
4.1. Overview	123
4.2. The Necessity Test Based on Security Grounds	124
4.3. The Necessity of Maintaining Public Order and Civil Life	128
4.4. The Necessity of Fulfilling the Obligations under the Geneva Conventions	132
4.5. The Necessity of Fulfilling Obligations under International Human Rights Law?	135
5. Conclusion	136

Chapter 5: The Administrative and Judicial Structures in Occupied Territory	137
1. Introduction	137
2. The Administrative Structures in Occupied Territory	137
2.1. Overview	137
2.2. Three Basic Principles	138
2.3. The Remoulding of Administrative Structures in Occupied Territory: Exceptions to the Three Basic Rules	140
2.4. Introduction of Democratic Governance	142
2.5. Alterations in Boundaries of Occupied Territories	142
2.6. The Prohibition of Coercion or Discrimination against Public Officials or Judges in Occupied Territory	143
2.7. Removal of Public Officials and the Necessity Test	144
2.8. Local Government	144
3. Judicial Structures in Occupied Territory	145
3.1. Administration of Justice	145
3.2. The Personal Scope of Jurisdiction in Occupied Territory	146
3.3. Judicial Review of <i>Ultra Vires</i> Acts of the Occupant?	147
4. Occupation Courts	157
4.1. Overview	157
4.2. Occupation Courts under GCIV	162
4.3. Occupation Courts and War Crimes	164
5. Conclusion	166
Chapter 6: Regulations of the Economy in Occupied Territory	167
1. Introduction: The General Principle of Good Administration of the Economy	167
2. Investments in Occupied Territory	169
3. Public Finance	171
3.1. Taxes	171
3.2. “Other Money Contributions”	173
3.3. Permissibility of Introducing New Taxes	175
3.4. Immunity of Occupation Authorities from Local Tax	181
4. Conclusion	182
Chapter 7: The Prohibition of the Destruction of Enemy Property in Occupied Territory	183
1. Introduction	183
2. A Scorched Earth Policy	184
3. Destruction of Property and the Military Necessity Test	186
4. Extensive Destruction and Appropriation of Property as a Grave Breach of GCIV	191
5. Conclusion	192

Chapter 8: The Prohibition of the Seizure and Use of Public Property in Occupied Territory	195
1. Introduction: The Distinction between Private and Public Property	195
2. State Property	196
2.1. Overview	196
2.2. Immovable State Property (Land and Buildings) of a Civilian Character	196
2.3. Immovable State Property (Land and Buildings) of a Military Nature	198
2.4. Movable State Property	199
2.5. Debt	201
3. Special Categories of Property	205
3.1. Overview	205
3.2. Property of Municipalities	206
3.3. Civilian Hospitals	206
3.4. Property of Civil Defence	207
3.5. Property Permanently Assigned to Civil Defence Organisations under Military Command	208
4. Exploitation of Natural Resources	209
4.1. General Rules	209
4.2. The Impact of the Principle of Self-Determination of Peoples upon the Rules on Exploitation of Natural Resources in Occupied Territory	215
5. Conclusion	216
 Chapter 9: Private Property in Occupied Territory	 217
1. Introduction	217
2. The Prohibition of Pillage	218
3. Temporary Use of Immovable Private Property	218
3.1. Overview	218
3.2. Justification for Requisitioning Private Immovable Property for Temporary Use: “Needs of the Army of Occupation” or “Imperative Military Necessity”?	222
4. Movable Private Property	226
4.1. Four Categories of Private Movable Property	226
4.2. Private Movables Essentially of a Non-Military Nature	226
4.3. Appliances of Communication or Transportation, Depots of Arms and <i>Munitions de Guerre</i>	230
4.4. Submarine Cables Linking an Occupied Territory with a Neutral Territory	234
4.5. Works of Art and Science	234

5. Expropriation	236
6. Conclusion	238
 Chapter 10: The Protection of Cultural Property in Occupied Territory	
1. Introduction	239
2. The Obligation to Assist, Preserve and Notify	243
3. The Principle That All Seizure or Destruction of, or Wilful Damage Done to, Institutions Dedicated to Religion, Charity, Education, the Arts and Sciences, Historic Monuments and Works of Art and Science is Prohibited	245
4. The Obligation to Prohibit, Prevent and Stop any Form of Theft, Pillage or Misappropriation of, and Any Acts of Vandalism Directed against, Cultural Property of Great Importance to the Cultural Heritage of Every People	246
5. The Prohibition on Requisitioning Cultural Property in Occupied Territory	247
6. The Obligation to Prohibit and Prevent Illicit Export of Cultural Property from Occupied Territory	248
7. The Obligation to Return Cultural Property Exported from Occupied Territory	249
8. The Obligation to Prohibit or Prevent Archaeological Excavations in Occupied Territory	251
9. The Obligations to Prohibit or Prevent the Alterations to (or the Change of Use of) Cultural Property in Occupied Territory	253
10. The Prohibition of Reprisal against Cultural Property	253
11. The Protection of Cultural Property in Occupied Territory and War Crimes	254
11.1. Overview	254
11.2. General Remarks on the War Crimes Based on Seizure of, Destruction of, or Wilful Damage Done to, Cultural Property in General	255
11.3. War Crimes of Seizure of Cultural Property	255
11.4. War Crimes Based on Extensive Destruction and Appropriation of Cultural Property in Occupied Territory	256
11.5. Criminalisation under the 1999 Second Hague Protocol	256
12. Conclusion	257

PART II

IHL-BASED RULES CONCERNING FUNDAMENTAL
GUARANTEES FOR INDIVIDUAL PERSONS IN
OCCUPIED TERRITORIES

Chapter 11: General Principles Governing the Protection of Fundamental Rights in International Humanitarian Law	261
1. Introduction	261
2. Conferral of Rights upon Individual Persons under IHL Treaty-Based Rules	262
3. General Principles of IHL Relating to the Protection of Rights of Individual Persons	264
3.1. Horizontal Effects – Positive Obligations	264
3.2. State Responsibility for Violations of Rights of Civilians in Occupied Territory	265
3.3. The Right of Individual Persons to Claim Reparations	265
4. The Fourth Geneva Convention and the Protection of Rights of Individual Persons	268
4.1. Overview	268
4.2. The Rights Guaranteed under Part III of GCIV	269
5. General Principles of the Fourth Geneva Convention Relating to the Protection of Fundamental Rights	270
5.1. Three “Minimum Core Guarantees” Recognised under Article 27 of GCIV	270
5.2. The Respect for Lives, Honour, Family Rights, Religious Convictions and Practices, and Manners and Customs	271
5.3. The Right to Equality and to Non-Discrimination	272
5.4. The Inviolability of the Fundamental Guarantees of Protected Persons in Occupied Territory	273
5.5. Measures of Control and Security	275
6. Derogation under Article 5 of GCIV	275
6.1. Overview	275
6.2. Derogation from Rights of Protected Persons in Occupied Territory	276
6.3. Two Non-Derogable Rights Expressly Mentioned in Article 5 of GCIV	277
7. The Specific Elaborations of the Rights of Humane Treatment	278
7.1. General Remarks	278
7.2. The Prohibition of Physical and Moral Coercion	279
7.3. The Prohibition of Measures Causing Physical Suffering or Extinction	280
7.3.1. Overview	280

7.3.2. Drafting Records	280
7.3.3. Ramifications	283
7.4. The Prohibition of “Measures of Intimidation or of Terrorism”	284
7.5. The Prohibition of Belligerent Reprisals	285
7.5.1. The Prohibition of Belligerent Reprisals against Protected Persons Who Fall in the Hands of the Adversary	285
7.5.2. Belligerent Reprisals against Civilians of an Adverse Party During the Conduct of Hostilities	285
7.6. The Prohibition on Taking Individual Persons as Hostages	289
7.6.1. Overview	289
7.6.2. Historical Evolution of the Prohibition on Taking Hostages	291
7.6.3. Criminalisation of Hostage-Taking since 1945	293
7.6.4. The Scope of Application <i>Ratione Personae</i> of the Victims of Hostage-Taking	295
8. Conclusion	296
 Chapter 12: Hostilities in Occupied Territory, Protected Persons, and Participants in Hostilities	 297
1. The Threshold for Determining Hostilities in Occupied Territory	297
1.1. The Resumption of Hostilities or the Outbreak of New Hostilities	297
1.2. The Resumption of Hostilities in Occupied Territory	299
1.3. Outbreak of Non-International Armed Conflict in Occupied Territory	300
1.4. Hostilities between the Occupying Power and the Armed Groups Who Are Not Resistance Movements within the Meaning of Article 4A(2) of GCIII	300
1.5. Cross-Border Hostilities between a State and Non-State Actors as Non-International Armed Conflicts	301
2. The Definition of Protected Persons and Civilians	304
2.1. Protected Persons under Article 4 of GCIV	304
2.2. Deprivation of Protected Persons Status?	307
2.3. The Concept of Civilians under API	307
3. “Combatants” in Occupied Territories	308
3.1. Members of Lawful Combatants of International Armed Conflict in Occupied Territory	308

3.2. Participants in Non-International Armed Conflict in Occupied Territory	309
3.2.1. Three Categories of Individual Persons Affected by Non-International Armed Conflict in Occupied Territory	309
3.2.2. Rebels and the “Revolving Door” Scenario	310
3.2.3. The Distinction between Current and Former Members of Armed Forces of the Occupied State	311
3.2.4. Classification of Foreign Infiltrators as Unprivileged Belligerents	312
4. Unprivileged Belligerents in Occupied Territory	313
4.1. Overview	313
4.2. Three Strands of Argument on the Scope of Protection of GCIV in Relation to Unprivileged Belligerents	314
5. The Concept of Direct Participation in Hostilities	319
5.1. Overview	319
5.2. The Temporal Element “For Such Time”	320
5.3. Direct Participation or Indirect Participation?	321
6. Conclusion	325
 Chapter 13: Specifically Prohibited Acts in Occupied Territory	 327
1. Introduction	327
2. Deportation or Forcible Transfer of Protected Persons	327
2.1. Overview	327
2.2. The General Scope of Application <i>Ratione Personae</i> of Article 49(1) of GCIV	330
2.3. Deportation of Infiltrators of Foreign Nationality	332
2.4. Controversy over the Customary Law Status of Article 49(1) of GCIV	333
2.5. The Collective or Individual Deportation?	337
2.6. Forcible Transfer of Civilians within Occupied Territory	339
2.7. The Question of Nationality and the Internal or External Nature of Deportation/Transfer	340
2.8. Unlawful Deportation or Transfer of Protected Persons as a Grave Breach Form of War Crimes	340
3. Evacuation	342
3.1. Overview	342
3.2. Derogation from Article 49(1) of GCIV?	343
3.3. Additional Requirements concerning Evacuation under API	344
4. Free Movement of Protected Persons	345

5. Deportation or Transfer by the Occupying Power of Part of its Own Population into the Occupied Territory	346
5.1. Overview	346
5.2. Is Coercion an Element of Transfer of the Civilians of the Occupant into Occupied Territory?	347
5.3. The Distinction between Transfer pursuant to a Policy and Voluntary Settlement?	347
5.4. Indirect Measure of Transfer?	349
5.5. Transfer by the Occupying Power of its own Population into Occupied Territory as a War Crime	350
6. Prohibition of Forced Labour	350
7. Conclusion	353
 Chapter 14: Economic, Social and Cultural Rights in Occupied Territory	 355
1. Introduction	355
2. The Right to Adequate Working Conditions and the Prohibition on Causing Unemployment	356
3. Rights to Food and Medical Supplies, and Other Humanitarian Relief Supplies	356
3.1. Obligations to Furnish Humanitarian Relief Supplies	356
3.2. Free Passage of Consignments	357
3.3. Duties on Transit States to Allow Free Passage of Relief Consignments	359
4. The Requirement of Respecting and Protecting Humanitarian Relief Personnel, Civil Defence Organisations, Medical Personnel, Civilian Hospitals and Medical Units	360
4.1. Overview	360
4.2. The Requirement of Respecting and Protecting Humanitarian Relief Personnel	360
4.3. The Duty to Respect and Protect Civil Defence Organisations	362
4.4. The Requirement of Respecting and Protecting Medical Personnel	363
4.5. The Requirement of Respecting and Protecting Civilian Hospitals and Medical Units	364
5. The Protection of Public Health and Hygiene	365
6. The Prohibition on Requisitioning Relief Supplies, and Immovable Property Belonging to Relief Societies etc.	365
6.1. The Prohibition on Requisitioning Relief Supplies	365
6.2. Diversion of Relief Consignments?	366
6.3. Requisition of Civilian Hospitals	367

6.4. Requisition of Shelters	367
6.5. The Prohibition on Requisitioning, or Diverging from Their Proper Use, Building or <i>Matériel</i> Belonging to, or Used by, Civil Defence Organisations	368
7. Rationales for Applying International Human Rights Law of Economic, Social and Cultural Nature in Occupied Territories	369
8. Derogation from Economic, Social and Cultural Rights	371
9. Conclusion	373

Chapter 15: IHL-Based Rights of Women and Children in

Occupied Territories	375
1. Introduction	375
2. IHL Treaty-Based Rights of Women in Occupied Territory	375
2.1. Overview	375
2.2. General Safeguards of the Rights of Women under IHL	376
2.3. The Rights of Women Derived from the Obligations to Respect and Protect	377
2.4. The Right of Women Deprived of Liberty to be Held in Quarters Separate from Men	378
2.5. The Responsibility of the Japanese Imperial Army for Sex Slavery (so-called “Comfort Women”) before and during World War II	379
2.6. Fragility and Ineffectiveness of the Gendered Rubrics of IHL	383
3. Rights of Children in Occupied Territory	384
3.1. Overview	384
3.2. Children’s Right to Education in Occupied Territory	385
3.3. The Right of Children Who are Deprived of Their Liberty to be Held in Quarters Separate from Adults	386
3.4. The Prohibition on Recruiting Children in Occupied Territory	387
3.5. Recruitment of Children as a War Crime	389
4. Conclusion	391

Chapter 16: Other Specific IHL-Based Rights of Individual Persons in Occupied Territory

Occupied Territory	393
1. Introduction	393
2. Respect for the Convictions and Religious Practices of Civilians	393
3. The Right to Apply to Protecting Powers and to the Red Cross or to Other Humanitarian Organisations	395
4. Conclusion	397

PART III

CONVERGENCE AND INTERACTION BETWEEN
INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW AND
INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

Chapter 17: The Relationship between International Human Rights Law and International Humanitarian Law in Occupied Territories ...	401
1. The Applicability of Human Rights during Armed Conflict	401
2. Fundamental Differences between International Human Rights Law and IHL	407
3. The Complementary Relationship between IHL and International Human Rights Law	408
4. The Threshold of Derogation Clauses under International Human Rights Law and the Applicability of Common Article 3	411
5. Advantage of Relying on IHL Rules in Assessing International Human Rights Law	411
6. IHL as <i>Lex Specialis</i>	414
6.1. Overview	414
6.2. Brief Examinations of the <i>Lex Specialis</i> Rule	415
6.3. Two Requirements of the <i>Lex Specialis</i> Rule	416
6.4. Two Contexts in Which the Application of the <i>Lex Specialis</i> Rule is Contemplated	417
6.5. Limit of the <i>Lex Specialis</i> Rule	418
6.6. The <i>Lex Specialis</i> Rule and the Interplay between IHL and International Human Rights Law	419
6.7. Circumstances in Which the <i>Lex Specialis</i> Rule Should be Excluded to Allow the Application of International Human Rights Law	422
7. The Methodology of Applying IHL Rules by Human Rights Treaty Bodies	425
7.1. Overview	425
7.2. Direct Application of IHL by Human Rights Treaty Bodies	425
7.3. Indirect Application of IHL by Human Rights Treaty Bodies	429
8. The Methodology of Expanding the Scope of Application of International Human Rights Law in Situations of Occupation and Armed Conflict	429
9. Kretzmer's Mixed Model	430
10. Fundamental Differences in the Underlying Rationales of IHL and International Human Rights Law Revisited	433
11. Conclusion	435

Chapter 18: The Effective Convergence between IHL and International Human Rights Law in Guaranteeing the Right to Life in Situations of “Volatile Occupation”	439
1. Introduction	439
2. Guidelines Derived from the Basic Principles on the Use of Force and Firearms by Law Enforcement Officials	441
3. Criteria for Assessing the Legality of Targeted Killing in Occupied Territory	442
4. Proportionality Assessment of the Right to Life in Situations of Hostilities	443
4.1. Modalities of Proportionality in Assessing the Right to Life in the Context of International Human Rights Law	443
4.2. The Approach of the European Court of Human Rights: the Precautionary Principle as Part of Proportionality	444
5. The Methodology of Incorporating Subtests of Proportionality Developed in the Context of International Human Rights Law into the Appraisal of Conduct of Hostilities	446
5.1. Overview	446
5.2. The Less Restrictive Alternative (LRA) Doctrine	446
5.3. The Applicability or not of the LRA Subtest to the Assessment of Conduct of Hostilities	447
5.4. Proportionality <i>Strict Sensu</i>	448
6. Procedural Requirements for Targeted Killings	450
6.1. Overview	450
6.2. <i>Ex ante</i> Procedural Requirements	450
6.3. <i>Post Factum</i> Procedural Requirements	451
6.4. The Duty of Effective Inquiries into Circumstances of Killing	452
6.5. The Duty to Prosecute and Punish Responsible Soldiers and Their Superiors	453
7. Conclusion	455
 Chapter 19: The Expanding Catalogue of Human Rights of Non-Derogable Nature	 459
1. Introduction	459
2. Article 4 of the ICCPR	460
2.1. Overview	460
2.2. The Requirement of a Proclamation of a State of Emergency	461
2.3. The Requirement of Immediate Notification	461
2.4. Existence of a State of Emergency	462
2.5. Consistency with Other Obligations under International Law	463

2.6. The Prohibition of Discrimination	464
2.7. The Principle of Proportionality	465
2.8. The List of Non-Derogable Rights Expressly Provided under Article 4 of the ICCPR	466
3. <i>General Comment No. 29</i> of the Human Rights Committee	466
3.1. Overview	466
3.2. The Legal Basis for the Human Rights Committee to Issue <i>General Comment No. 29</i>	467
3.3. Normative Status of <i>General Comment No. 29</i>	468
4. The Expanded Catalogue of Non-Derogable Rights under <i>General Comment No. 29</i>	468
4.1. General Remarks	468
4.2. The Right to Humane Treatment	471
4.3. The Prohibition on Taking Hostages, Abductions or Unacknowledged Detention	473
4.3.1. Overview	473
4.3.2. Abduction	473
4.4. The Rights of Persons Belonging to Minorities	474
4.5. The Prohibition of Deportation or Forcible Transfer of Populations	476
4.6. The Prohibition of Propaganda for War and of Advocacy of National, Racial, or Religious Hatred That Would Constitute Incitement to Discrimination, Hostility or Violence	476
5. Other Non-Derogable Rights Identified by the Human Rights Committee	478
5.1. The Right to an Effective Remedy under Article 2(3)(a) of the ICCPR	478
5.2. Judicial Guarantees in Relation to Non-Derogable Rights	479
5.3. Core Elements of Fair Trial Guarantees	480
6. Conclusion	481
 Chapter 20: Procedural Safeguards and Fair Trial Guarantees in Occupied Territory	 483
1. Introduction	483
2. Assigned Residence and Internment/Administrative Detention	483
2.1. The Legal Basis for Depriving Persons of Liberty in Occupied Territory	483
2.2. The Legal Basis for Procedural Safeguards of Persons Deprived of Liberty in Occupied Territory	485
2.3. The Limited Scope of the Procedural Safeguards for Internees/Administrative Detainees	486

2.4. Procedural Safeguards for Persons Other than Protected Persons in Occupied Territory	487
2.5. The Analogous Application of Procedural Safeguards to Persons Captured in the UN-Administered Territory	488
3. General Principles Governing Internment/Administrative Detention of Individual Persons in Occupied Territory	489
3.1. The Principle That Internment or Administrative Detention Must be Carried out in Accordance with the Principle of Legality	489
3.2. The Principle That Internment or Administrative Detention is an Exceptional Measure	491
3.3. The Principle That Internment or Administrative Detention Must Not be an Alternative to Criminal Proceedings	492
4. Procedural Safeguards That are Expressly Recognised in IHL Treaties	494
4.1. Overview	494
4.2. The Procedural Safeguards That are Largely Influenced by International Human Rights Law	494
4.2.1. The Right of Interned or Administratively Detained Persons to be Informed Promptly, in a Language They Understand, of the Reasons for such Deprivation of Liberty	494
4.2.2. The Right to Contest Measures of Internment or Administrative Detention	495
4.2.3. The Right to Periodic Review	498
4.2.4. The Application of Judicial Review in Occupied Territory	500
4.2.5. The Right to Release with the Minimum Delay Possible	501
4.2.6. The Prohibition on Administrative Detention of Indefinite Nature	502
4.3. The Procedural Safeguards That Are Specific to IHL	504
4.3.1. Immunity from Arrest, Prosecution and Conviction for Acts Committed, or for Opinions Expressed, before the Occupation	504
4.3.2. The Requirement That Persons Interned or Administratively Detained Must be Registered and Held in a Recognised Place of Internment or Administrative Detention	504
5. Procedural Safeguards That Need to be Supplemented by the Practice of International Human Rights Law	505
5.1. The Right to Legal Assistance	505
5.2. The Right to Attend at the Process of Review	506

6. Fair Trial Guarantees of Accused Persons in Occupied Territory – the Interplay between IHL and International Human Rights Law Disaggregated	506
6.1. Overview	506
6.2. The Legal Basis for Fair Trial Guarantees under IHL and International Human Rights Law	507
7. The Normative Status, and the Weight of Evidence, of the Documents and Case-Law of International Human Rights Law in Ascertaining Customary Norms concerning Fair Trial Guarantees	510
7.1. The Structure of Analysis	510
7.2. The First Step: the Identification of the Customary Law Status of Fair Trial Guarantees Contained in IHL Treaty Provisions	510
7.2.1. Overview	510
7.2.2. The Customary Law Status of the Elements of the Rights of the Accused That Are Safeguarded in Article 75(4) API	511
7.2.3. Additional Elements of the Rights of the Accused, Which Can be Derived from Article 75(4) API, and the Ascertainment of Corresponding Customary Rules	512
7.3. The Second Step: Ascertaining the Non-Derogability of Corresponding Rules Embodied under Human Rights Treaties	514
7.4. The Third Step: The Methodology of Recruiting Specific Elements and Principles from Documents and the Case-Law of the Monitoring Bodies of Human Rights Treaties	516
7.4.1. Overview	516
7.4.2. The Normative Significance of the Case-Law of the Monitoring Bodies of Human Rights Treaties in Ascertaining Customary International Law	517
7.4.3. The Normative Significance of Documents of the Monitoring Bodies of Human Rights Treaties in Ascertaining Customary International Law	519
7.4.4. Is it Possible to Read Additional Non-Derogable Elements of Fair Trial Guarantees in the Human Rights Committee’s <i>General Comment No. 29</i> ?	520
8. The Elements of the Rights of the Accused, Which are Expressly Contained in Article 75(4) API	520
8.1. Fundamental Principles of Criminal Law	520
8.2. The Right to be Presumed Innocent	521

8.3. The Right to be Informed of the Nature and the Cause of Accusation	522
8.4. The Right to Trial by an Independent, Impartial and Regularly Constituted Court	523
8.4.1. Overview	523
8.4.2. Non-Derogability under the Practice of International Human Rights Law	524
8.4.3. The Role of International Human Rights Law in Complementing Procedural Guarantees of Occupation Courts	525
8.4.4. The Trial of Civilians by Military Courts	526
8.4.5. The Trial of Unprivileged Belligerents in Occupied Territory	527
8.5. The Right of the Accused to be Present at the Trial	529
8.6. The Right to Examine Witnesses or the Right to Have Witnesses Examined	530
8.7. The Right of the Accused Not to be Compelled to Testify against Him/Herself and the Protection against Coerced Confessions	531
8.8. The Right of the Convicted Persons to be Informed of Available Remedies and of their Time-Limits	532
8.9. <i>Non bis in idem</i> (Freedom from Double Jeopardy)	532
8.10. The Right to Public Proceedings	534
9. The Elements of the Rights of the Accused, Which are Implied from the General Terms under Article 75(4) API	535
9.1. The Rights Relating to Means of Defence	535
9.1.1. Overview	535
9.1.2. The Right to Defend Oneself or to be Assisted by a Lawyer of One's Own Choice	537
9.1.3. The Right to Free Legal Assistance	538
9.1.4. The Right to Sufficient Time and Facilities to Prepare the Defence	539
9.1.5. The Right of the Accused to Communicate Freely with Counsel	540
9.1.6. The Right to the Assistance of an Interpreter or Translator	540
9.2. The Right to Trial without Undue Delay	541
9.3. The Right to Remain Silent	543
9.4. The Right of Convicted Persons to Appeal	543
10. Conclusion	545

PART IV

EVOLVING ISSUES OF THE LAW OF OCCUPATION

Chapter 21: The Extraterritorial Application of International Human Rights Law in Occupied Territory	551
1. Introduction: Extraterritorial Applicability of International Human Rights Law in Occupied Territory	551
2. The Meaning of the Term “within its territory and subject to its jurisdiction” under Article 2(1) ICCPR	553
2.1. <i>Travaux Préparatoires</i> of Article 2(1) ICCPR	553
2.2. The Approach of the Human Rights Committee	557
2.3. The Human Rights Committee and the “Subsequent Practice” of States Parties	559
3. The Meaning of the Term “within their jurisdiction” under Article 1 ECHR	559
3.1. <i>Travaux Préparatoires</i> of the ECHR	559
3.2. The Approach of the European Court of Human Rights in Relation to the Meaning of Jurisdiction under Article 1 ECHR	560
4. Doctrinal Discourse on the Meaning of the Words “within its territory and subject to its jurisdiction”	562
5. The Circumstances in Which the Extraterritorial Application of International Human Rights Law Can be Envisaged	564
5.1. Overview	564
5.2. Cases Where a State Exercises Control over a Territory of Another State	565
5.3. <i>Bankovic</i> and the <i>Espace Juridique</i> Doctrine	569
5.4. Cases Where a State Exercises Control, Power or Authority over Individual Persons	572
5.5. Cases Where a State Exercises Control over the Infliction of the Alleged Violation	579
6. Conclusion	581
Chapter 22: The Applicability of the Law of Occupation to UN Peace Support Operations and UN Post-Conflict Administration	583
1. Introduction	583
2. The Applicability of Customary IHL to the UN Peacekeeping Forces	585
3. Can the UN Become Parties to IHL Treaties?	587
4. The Practice of the United Nations and the <i>UN Secretary-General’s Bulletin on Observance by United Nations Forces of International Humanitarian Law</i>	589

5. Other Indices for the Applicability of IHL Rules to UN Forces	593
6. The Distinction between Enforcement Action and Non-Enforcement Action in Assessing the Applicability of IHL	594
7. Consent as a Determining Factor?	597
8. The Convention on the Safety of the United Nations and Associated Personnel	599
9. The Threshold for Determining Whether the UN Forces Have Become Parties to an Armed Conflict	602
10. The UN Post-Conflict Administration and the Law of Occupation	602
10.1. The UN Practice Relating to Post-Conflict Administration	602
10.2. The Appraisal of the Applicability of the Law of Occupation to the UN Administration	604
11. Conclusion	605

PART V

THEORETICAL APPRAISAL

Chapter 23: The Nature of Customary International Humanitarian Law Revisited	611
1. Introduction	611
2. Inquiries into the Formation of Customary International Law in General	612
2.1. Two Constituent Elements: State Practice and <i>Opinio Juris</i>	612
2.2. Some Problems Relating to State Practice	613
2.3. Can Verbal Acts Constitute Practice Free of a Specific Normative Belief?	613
2.4. Some Problems Relating to <i>Opinio Juris</i>	615
2.5. Subjective Elements of State Practice, Which are Indicative of <i>Opinio Juris</i>	618
3. Methodology of Ascertaining Customary IHL	620
3.1. Inductive Approach	620
3.2. Deductive Approach	621
4. The Relationship between a Treaty-based Norm and Customary Law	622
4.1. The Implications of the <i>North Sea Continental Shelf Cases</i> Revisited	622

4.2. The Requirement of “a very widespread and representative participation in the convention”	624
4.3. Critical Appraisal of the Relationship between Treaty-Based Norms and Customary Law	625
5. “Modern” vs. “Traditional” Understanding of the Formation of Customary International Law	628
5.1. Overview	628
5.2. Traditional Customs	629
5.3. Modern Understanding of Customs	630
5.4. Fidler’s Three Perspectives of Evaluating Modern Customs	631
5.5. Descriptive Accuracy and Normative Appeal Revisited	635
5.6. Modern Customs Based on Deduction from Moral Substance	638
6. Apology and Utopia: Dealing with Koskenniemi’s Critique of Legal Argumentations	641
6.1. Overview	641
6.2. Traditional Customs and Apology	643
6.3. Modern Customs and Utopia	644
7. Evaluations of Koskenniemi’s Argumentation	645
7.1. Overview	645
7.2. Beckett’s Proposal for a “Virtual Sovereign” and the Reflexive Process of Custom Formation	645
8. Dworkin’s Interpretative Theory	647
9. The Sliding Scale Conceptualisation of Custom	649
10. Anthea Roberts’ Proposal to Balance Fit and Substance in Rawls’ “Reflective Methodology”	653
11. Conclusion	655

Chapter 24: Identifying Customary IHL in Occupied Territories on the Basis of its Interplay with Customary International Human Rights Law	657
1. Introduction	657
2. The Proposed Framework of Customary IHL Relating to Fundamental Guarantees in Occupied Territories	657
3. The Process of Ascertaining Customary IHL in the Interaction with Customary International Human Rights Law	659
4. Distinct Variables in the Context of the Law of Occupation	661
4.1. Overview	661
4.2. The Underlying Concept of Military Necessity	661

4.3. Shifting Nature of Occupied Territories: Do Areas Remain Occupied Territories Subject to Law Enforcement, or Become Subject to Rules of Conduct of Warfare?	662
4.4. Implications of Individual Criminal Responsibility	663
5. Conclusion	666
Table of Case-Law	669
Table of Treaties and Other Major International Instruments	703
Bibliography	709
Index	741